

Inhaltsverzeichnis

Table of Contents

Vorwort	V
Foreword	VII
Inhaltsverzeichnis	IX

Helmut Koziol

Einleitung	3
-------------------------	----------

Helmut Koziol

Introduction	9
---------------------------	----------

Georg Kodek und Karl Stöger

Politikerhaftung in Österreich	13
---	-----------

I. Einleitung	13
II. Begriffsbestimmung	14
III. Überblick: Schadensauslösendes Verhalten in Gesetzgebung und Verwaltung	15
IV. Gesetzlicher Rahmen der Haftung	17
A. Allgemeines	17
B. Hoheitliches Handeln	18
1. Gesetzgebung	18
2. Hilfsorgane der Gesetzgebung	19
3. Hoheitsverwaltung iwS	19
C. Privatwirtschaftsverwaltung	20
D. Verletzung von Unionsrecht	21
E. Ersatzfähige Schäden	22
F. Außen- und Innenhaftung	24
V. Präzisierung der Sorgfaltspflichten	25
A. Vorbemerkung	25
B. Hoheitliches Handeln	27
C. Privatwirtschaftsverwaltung	28

1.	Determinanten staatlichen privatwirtschaftlichen Handelns	28
2.	Besonderheit »politischer« Entscheidungsprozesse	29
3.	Tätigkeit in staatsnahen Unternehmen	31
4.	Business Judgment Rule	32
VI.	Mäßigung der Haftung	33
VII.	Verpflichtung zur Durchsetzung von Ansprüchen	36
VIII.	Zuständigkeit und Verfahren	39
IX.	Fazit	40

Georg Kodek and Karl Stöger

	Liability of Politicians in Austria	41
I.	Introduction	41
II.	Definition of terms	42
III.	Overview of conduct that may give rise to damage in the course of legislation and administration	43
IV.	Legal framework of liability	45
A.	In general	45
B.	Sovereign acts	46
1.	Legislation	46
2.	Bodies assisting the legislature	47
3.	Sovereign administration in a broader sense	47
C.	Private sector administration	48
D.	Violation of EU law	49
E.	Recoverable damage	50
F.	External and internal liability	52
V.	Specification of the duties of care	53
A.	Preliminary remark	53
B.	Sovereign acts	55
C.	Private sector administration	55
1.	Determinants for when the state acts in the private sector	55
2.	Special feature of »political« decision-making processes	57
3.	Activity in enterprises close to the state	58
4.	Business Judgment Rule	60
VI.	Mitigation of liability	60

VII.	Obligation to pursue claims	64
VIII.	Jurisdiction and proceeding	66
IX.	Conclusion	67

Matthias Cornils

	»Politikerhaftung« in Deutschland	69
I.	Einführung	69
II.	Kreis der haftenden oder haftungsauslösenden Personen (»Politiker«)	71
	A. Amtsträger mit politischer Funktion	71
	B. Personenstatusbezogene vs. Tätigkeitsbezogene Differenzierungen im Haftungsrecht	73
	C. Teilgruppenbildung	74
	1. Parlamentsabgeordnete	76
	2. Minister und (parlamentarische) Staatssekretäre	77
	3. Politische Beamte im haftungsrechtlichen Sinn	77
	4. Kommunale Amtsträger	78
III.	Haftungskonstellationen und Haftungsmaßstäbe	79
	A. Haftungsbeziehungen	80
	B. Haftungsgrundlagen und Maßstäbe	81
	1. »in Ausübung eines öffentlichen Amtes«	81
	2. (Verbands-)Haftung für hoheitliches Verhalten	83
	a. Eigenarten der Beamtenhaftung nach § 839 BGB	84
	b. Staatshaftung	86
	3. Eigen- und Verbandshaftung für privatrechtlich qualifiziertes Verhalten	88
	4. Innenhaftungsrecht	88
IV.	Die Schadensersatzverantwortlichkeit von Politikern im Koordinatensystem des Haftungsrechts	89
	A. Außenhaftung des Verbands	89
	1. für Parlamentsabgeordnete	89
	a. öffentlich-rechtlich	89
	b. privatrechtlich	93
	2. für die Regierungsmitglieder (Minister, ggf. parl. Staatssekretäre)	93
	a. öffentlich-rechtlich	93
	b. privatrechtlich	96

3.	für die »politischen Beamten« (Abteilungsleiter im Ministerium)	96
a.	öffentlich-rechtlich	96
b.	privatrechtlich	97
4.	für kommunale Beamte (Gemeinderat und Bürgermeister)	97
a.	öffentlich-rechtlich	97
b.	privatrechtlich	98
B.	Außenhaftung des Politikers gegenüber Dritten (Beamten(eigen)haftung)	98
1.	Parlamentsabgeordnete	98
a.	öffentlich-rechtlich	98
b.	privatrechtlich	99
2.	Regierungsmitglieder	99
a.	öffentlich-rechtlich	99
b.	privatrechtlich	99
3.	politische Beamte	101
a.	öffentlich-rechtlich	101
b.	privatrechtlich	101
4.	kommunale Beamte	101
a.	öffentlich-rechtlich	101
b.	privatrechtlich	101
C.	Innenregress der Körperschaft gegenüber dem Politiker	103
1.	Parlamentsabgeordnete	103
2.	Regierungsmitglieder	103
3.	politische Beamte	103
4.	kommunale Beamte	104
D.	Innenhaftung des Politikers gegenüber dem Staat	105
1.	Parlamentsabgeordnete	105
2.	Regierungsmitglieder	105
3.	politische Beamte	106
4.	kommunale Beamte	106
V.	Fazit	107

Matthias Cornils

Liability of Politicians in Germany	109
I. Introduction	109
II. Circle of people liable or triggering liability (›politicians‹)	111
A. Office-holders with political functions	111
B. Personal status related and activity area related differences in liability law	112
C. Subgroups	114
1. Members of Parliament	116
2. Ministers and (parliamentary) state secretaries	116
3. Political officials in a liability law sense	117
4. Communal officials	118
III. Liability constellations and standards for liability	119
A. Liability relations	119
B. Bases and standards of liability	120
1. ›in performance of public office‹	120
2. (Association's) liability for sovereign conduct	122
a. Special features of liability of officials according to § 839 BGB	123
b. State liability	125
3. Personal and association liability for conduct subject to private law	127
4. Internal liability law	127
IV. The responsibility of politicians to compensate within the coordinates system of liability law	128
A. External liability of the association	128
1. For members of parliament	128
a. Public law	128
b. Private law	132
2. For the members of the government (Ministers, and as applicable state secretaries)	132
a. Public law	132
b. Private law	134
3. For ›political officials‹ (heads of departments in Ministries)	135
a. Public law	135
b. Private law	135

4.	For communal officials (municipal council and mayor)	136
a.	Public law	136
b.	Private law	136
B.	External liability of the politician in relation to third parties (officials' own liability)	137
1.	Members of parliament	137
a.	Public law	137
b.	Private law	137
2.	Members of government	137
a.	Public law	137
b.	Private law	137
3.	Political officials	139
a.	Public law	139
b.	Private law	139
4.	Communal officials	139
a.	Public law	139
b.	Private law	140
C.	Internal recourse of the public body against the politician	141
1.	Members of parliament	141
2.	Members of government	141
3.	Political officials	141
4.	Communal officials	142
D.	Internal liability of the politician to the state	143
1.	Members of parliament	143
2.	Members of government	143
3.	Political officials	144
4.	Communal officials	144
V.	Conclusion	145

Frédéric Krauskopf • Raphael Märki • Ricarda Stoppelhaar

	Die vermögensrechtliche Verantwortlichkeit von Politikern in der Schweiz	147
I.	Einleitung	147
II.	Begriff »Politiker«	148
III.	Gesetzlicher Rahmen der Politikerhaftung	149
A.	Grundsätzliches	149

	B. Die Haftung von Staatsangestellten	150
	1. Auf Bundesebene	150
	2. Auf kantonaler Ebene	153
IV.	Zu den Haftungsvoraussetzungen und zum Haftungsumfang insbesondere	160
	A. Haftungsvoraussetzungen bei unmittelbarer Schädigung des Staates	160
	1. Schaden	161
	2. Verletzung einer Amtspflicht	163
	3. Kausalität	168
	4. Verschulden	169
	B. Haftungsvoraussetzungen bei mittelbarer Schädigung des Staates (Regresshaftung)	171
	1. Schaden	173
	2. Vorsatz oder grobe Fahrlässigkeit	174
	3. Unverzügliche Benachrichtigung	174
	C. Umfang der Haftung	175
	1. Gesetzliche Grundlagen	175
	2. Grundsätze der Schadenersatzbemessung	175
	3. Haftungsreduktion	176
	4. Fokus: Haftung mehrerer Politiker	177
	D. Notwendigkeit einer Haftungsbegrenzung	178
	1. Berücksichtigung des »Amtsrisikos«	178
	2. Rechtspolitische Argumente	179
	3. Lösungsvorschlag für das schweizerische Recht	180
V.	Verjährung	181
	A. Auf Bundesebene	182
	B. Auf kantonaler Ebene	183
VI.	Zuständigkeit für die Geltendmachung von Ersatz- und Rückgriffsansprüchen	184
	A. Auf Bundesebene	184
	B. Auf Ebene Kanton	185
VII.	Rechtsprechung zur Politikerhaftung	186
VIII.	Ausgewählte Fragen	186
	A. Pflicht zum Klagen?	187
	1. Auf Bundesebene	187
	2. Auf kantonaler Ebene	187
	B. Immunität von Politikern	188
IX.	Ergebnisse	190

Frédéric Krauskopf • Raphael Märki • Ricarda Stoppelhaar

The Legal Financial Responsibility of Politicians

in Switzerland 193

I. Introduction 193

II. Definition of ›politician‹ 194

III. Legal framework for politicians' liability 195

 A. In general 195

 B. The liability of state employees 196

 1. At federal level 196

 2. At cantonal level 199

IV. On the liability prerequisites and scope of liability in particular 205

 A. Liability prerequisites in the case of damage inflicted directly to the state 206

 1. Damage 206

 2. Violation of an official duty 208

 3. Causation 213

 4. Fault 214

 B. Prerequisites of liability for indirect damage to the state (recourse liability) 216

 1. Damage 217

 2. Intention or gross negligence 218

 3. Immediate information 218

 C. Extent of liability 219

 1. Statutory foundations 219

 2. Principles for assessing the damage 219

 3. Reduction of liability 221

 4. Focus: liability of several politicians 221

 D. Necessity for limitation of liability 223

 1. Consideration of the ›risk of office‹ 223

 2. Legal policy arguments 223

 3. Proposed solution for Swiss law 224

V. Prescription 225

 A. At federal level 226

 B. At cantonal level 227

VI. Competence for asserting claims for compensation or recourse claims 227

 A. At federal level 228

	B. At cantonal level	229
VII.	Case law on politicians' liability	230
VIII.	Selected questions	230
	A. Duty to take action?	230
	1. At federal level	231
	2. At cantonal level	231
	B. Immunity of politicians	232
IX.	Results	233

Marios Kalogeropoulos and Thomas Perroud

	Accountability of Politicians in France	235
I.	Introduction	235
II.	Liability for damage to individuals (third parties)	238
	A. The principle of autonomy. The distinction of faults ...	238
	1. Personal liability of politicians before ordinary courts	238
	a. General remarks	238
	b. The definition of personal fault	239
	2. State liability and division of jurisdictions	243
	a. Definition of <i>faute de service</i>	243
	b. Causality and recoverable damage	245
	c. State liability before ordinary courts	245
	d. The <i>acte de gouvernement</i>	246
	B. The principle of autonomy undermined	247
III.	Liability for damage to the administration	249
	A. The general regime of politicians' liability towards their administrative bodies	249
	1. An exception becomes the rule	249
	2. A jurisdictional ambiguity	252
	3. Procedure and rights of third parties	253
	4. Recoverable damage	255
	B. The financial accountability of politicians as authorising officers	255
	1. The separation between accountants and <i>ordonnateurs</i>	255
	2. The particular nature of the Budgetary and Financial Discipline Court	256
	3. The long-standing financial immunity of ministers	257

4.	The limited accountability of local elected officials	258
a.	Immunity and justification	258
b.	Exceptions to immunity and relevant case law	259
c.	Procedure and penalties	262
C.	The financial accountability of politicians	
as de facto accountants		263
1.	Types of conduct potentially qualified	
as unauthorised handling of public funds		263
a.	General remarks	263
b.	Cases concerning illegal use of public funds ...	266
2.	Procedure before audit courts and recoverable	
damage		267
IV.	Conclusion – Final remarks	269

Attila Menyhárd

	Accountability of Politicians in Hungary	273
I.	Introduction	273
II.	Rights, duties and liabilities of politicians	274
A.	Regulatory framework	274
1.	Unlawfulness	275
2.	Fault	276
3.	Causation	279
4.	Limitation of liability	280
B.	Vicarious liability	280
1.	The basis of vicarious liability	280
2.	Consequences of vicarious liability	282
3.	Immunity	283
4.	Joint and several liability	284
5.	Recourse right	284
6.	The scope of vicarious liability	285
C.	Individual liability	286
D.	Liability for damages in the context of	
demonstrations and other assemblies		287
E.	Interference with inherent rights of others	288
III.	Concluding remarks	289

Anne Marie Frøseth

The Accountability of Politicians under the Law of Damages in Norway	291
I. The principles and values underlying the Norwegian model of government	291
II. The main features of the model for accountability	294
A. Bases of liability	294
B. General questions of interest regarding the accountability of politicians	299
III. Politicians in the national government	300
A. The organisational structure and the political dynamics between the different institutions	300
B. Breach of constitutional duties	301
C. Specific cases before the Court of Impeachment	303
D. Special protection of freedom of speech	304
IV. The role of local government bodies	306
V. The exercise of public authority through political organs	307
A. Omissions or wrongs caused by the Storting during exercise of its legislative power	307
B. Omissions or wrongs caused as part of the exercise of the political power to allocate funds	309
C. Invalid decisions under the exercise of public authority	311
1. Different approaches to different types of errors ...	311
2. Compensation due to reasonable expectations caused by an advance commitment by the public authority	315
VI. The exercise of private autonomy in connection with financial dispositions	317
VII. Liability for corruption	319
VIII. Personal responsibility of politicians in executive positions	321
IX. Reduction of liability	322
A. On contributory conduct and proportional reduction of damages	322
B. Reduction in damages	323
X. Conclusion	325

Katarzyna Ludwichowska-Redo

Accountability of Politicians in Poland	327
I. Scope of analysis	327
II. Legal framework of politicians' liability	329
A. Liability for unlawful exercise of public authority	329
B. Liability for lawful exercise of public authority	332
C. Liability of the individual perpetrator	333
1. General remarks	333
2. Labour law regime in detail	335
a. Liability of an employee towards his employer	335
b. Liability towards third parties	336
3. Special regime: mandatory recourse in cases of manifest law violations	338
III. Fault and wrongfulness as liability prerequisites	340
A. Liability of the individual perpetrator	340
1. Tort law	340
2. Labour law	343
3. Act on liability for a manifest law violation	344
B. Public authorities' liability	344
IV. Immunity from liability	345
V. Possible instances of liability – selected examples	347
A. Liability of an individual for mismanaging public funds	347
B. Liability for incorrect public finance planning or incorrect implementation of budget law	348
1. Liability for excessive public debt?	349
2. Claims of local self-government units	350
3. Special case: Legislative omission in breach of the principle of bona fide legislation	353
C. Liability for promises made in the course of election campaigns?	354
VI. Practical relevance of politicians' individual liability	355
VII. Conclusion	356

Pedro del Olmo • Diego Marín-Barnuevo • Pilar Otero

Liability of Politicians in Spain	357
I. Introduction	357
II. The Criminal Law Basics of the Politician’s Liability	357
A. Organic Act 5/2010 of 22 June	358
B. Organic Act 1/2015 of 30 March	359
C. International Anti-Corruption Strategy	360
D. Making the Crime Unprofitable	361
III. Ex Ante Approach to the Accountability of Politicians in Public Law	363
A. Act 3/2015 on High-Level Officials	363
B. Act 19/2013 on Transparency and Good Governance	364
IV. Ex Post Approach to the Accountability of Politicians in Public Law	366
A. Ex Post Measures and Harm Suffered by the Public Administration	366
1. The General Budget Act	367
2. Act 19/2013 on Transparency and Good Governance	370
3. Accounting Liability	372
a. Introduction to Accounting Liability	373
b. Accounting Liability Procedures	375
B. Ex Post Measures and Harm Suffered by a Private Law Subject	378
1. So-Called Patrimonial Liability of the Public Administration	378
2. Is it Possible to Directly Sue the Official or Politician?	380
3. The Public Administration’s Recourse Right Against Officials and Authorities	382
V. Conclusions	384

Jef De Mot and Michael Faure

Liability for Politicians: An Economic Perspective	389
I. Introduction	389
II. Politicians in Law and Economics	391
III. Literature Review	394
IV. Liability of Politicians	396

A.	Can Liability Deter?	396
B.	Functionality of Liability of Politicians	399
1.	Cost Internalisation via Deterrence	400
2.	Removing Incentives for Private Parties to Engage in Socially Detrimental Behaviour	400
3.	Liability of Politicians as a Monitoring Device	401
C.	Limits of Civil Liability of Public Authorities	401
1.	Chilling Effects	401
2.	Dilute Incentives of Victims	402
3.	Pure Economic Loss	403
4.	Litigation Costs	404
5.	Time Horizon	404
6.	Effects of Tort Law versus Reputational Losses	405
7.	Financial Effects	407
D.	Alternatives	409
V.	Individual Liability?	409
VI.	A Case for (Qualified) Immunity?	412
VII.	Conclusion	416

Helmut Koziol

	Politikerhaftung: Schlussbemerkungen	417
I.	Der unbefriedigende Zustand	417
II.	Ausreichende Haftungsgrundlagen?	419
III.	Die berufliche Immunität und der Sonderbereich der Haftung für legislatives Unrecht	425
IV.	Der Schaden und dessen Verursachung als Haftungsvoraussetzungen	430
V.	Das Nadelöhr der Rechtswidrigkeit	431
VI.	Das Verschulden als Haftungsvoraussetzung	438
VII.	Der Schutzbereich der Norm	441
VIII.	Überschießende Abschreckung?	443
IX.	Probleme der Geltendmachung von Ersatzansprüchen	445
X.	Reformbedarf und Vorschläge für Änderungen	446

▷

Helmut Koziol

The Liabilities of Politicians: Concluding Remarks	449
I. The dissatisfactory status quo	449
II. Sufficient bases for liability?	451
III. Professional immunity and the special area of liability for legislative wrongs	456
IV. The damage and its causation as prerequisites for liability	461
V. Unlawfulness as the eye of the needle	462
VI. Fault as a prerequisite for liability	468
VII. The protective purpose of the rule	471
VIII. Excessive deterrence?	473
IX. Problems regarding the assertion of compensation claims	475
X. Need for reform and proposals for changes	476
 Publications	 479

